## SENATE, No. 379

# **STATE OF NEW JERSEY**

## 219th LEGISLATURE

PRE-FILED FOR INTRODUCTION IN THE 2020 SESSION

Sponsored by: Senator LORETTA WEINBERG District 37 (Bergen)

### **SYNOPSIS**

Makes various changes to law addressing meetings of public bodies to provide public with greater access to meetings and information about meetings.

## **CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT**

Introduced Pending Technical Review by Legislative Counsel.



**AN ACT** making various changes to the law addressing meetings of public bodies and amending P.L.2002, c.91 and amending and supplementing P.L.1975, c.231.

345

1

2

**BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

6 7 8

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

- 1. Section 2 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-7) is amended to read as follows:
- The Legislature finds and declares that the right of the public to be present at all meetings of public bodies, and to witness in full detail all phases of the deliberation, policy formulation, and decision making of public bodies, is vital to the enhancement and proper functioning of the democratic process; that secrecy in public affairs fosters the risk of corruption and official misconduct, undermines the faith of the public in government and the public's effectiveness in fulfilling its role in a democratic society, and hereby declares it to be the public policy of this State to insure the right of its citizens to have adequate advance notice of and the right to attend, and to review the minutes and recordings of, all meetings of public bodies at which any business affecting the public is discussed or acted upon in any way except only in those circumstances where otherwise the public interest would be clearly endangered or the personal privacy or guaranteed rights of individuals would be clearly in danger of unwarranted invasion.

The Legislature further declares it to be the public policy of this State to insure that the aforesaid rights are implemented pursuant to the provisions of this act so that no confusion, misconstructions or misinterpretations may thwart the purposes hereof.

The Legislature, therefore, declares that it is the understanding and the intention of the Legislature that in order to be covered by the provisions of this act a public body must be organized by law and be collectively empowered as a multi-member voting body to spend public funds or affect persons' rights; that, therefore, informal or purely advisory bodies with no effective authority are not covered, nor are groupings composed of a public official with subordinates or advisors, who are not empowered to act by vote such as a mayor or the Governor meeting with department heads or cabinet members, that specific exemptions are provided for the Judiciary, parole bodies, the State Commission of Investigation, the Apportionment Commission and political party organization; that to be covered by the provisions of this act a meeting must be open to all the public body's members, and the members present must intend to discuss or act on the public body's business, except that a subcommittee of a public body may be subject to certain of the act's

EXPLANATION – Matter enclosed in bold-faced brackets [thus] in the above bill is not enacted and is intended to be omitted in the law.

- 1 provisions that address adequate notice of meetings and records of
- 2 <u>meetings</u>; and therefore, typical partisan caucus meetings and
- 3 chance encounters of members of public bodies are neither covered
- 4 by the provisions of this act, nor are they intended to be so covered.
- 5 (cf: P.L.1981, c.176, s.1)

6 7

8

- 2. Section 3 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-8) is amended to read as follows:
  - 3. As used in this act:
- 10 "Public body" means a commission, authority, board, 11 council, committee or any other group of two or more persons 12 organized under the laws of this State, and collectively empowered 13 as a voting body to perform a public governmental function 14 affecting the rights, duties, obligations, privileges, benefits, or other 15 legal relations of any person, or collectively authorized to spend 16 public funds including the Legislature, but does not mean or include 17 the judicial branch of the government, any grand or petit jury, any 18 parole board or any agency or body acting in a parole capacity, the 19 State Commission of Investigation, the Apportionment Commission 20 established under Article IV, Section III, of the Constitution, or any 21 political party committee organized under Title 19 of the Revised "Public body" also means, but is not limited to, an 22 23 independent authority, redevelopment entity, or improvement 24 authority, as well as any quasi-governmental agency. "Public 25 body" also means, but is not limited to, the New Jersey League of 26 Municipalities, the New Jersey Association of Counties, the New 27 Jersey State Interscholastic Athletic Association, the New Jersey 28 School Boards Association, the Educational Information and 29 Resource Center, and any joint insurance fund established by two or 30 more public bodies, and any substantially similar successor 31 organization or association.
- 32 b. "Meeting" means and includes any gathering whether 33 corporeal or by means of communication equipment, which is 34 attended by, or open to, all of the members of a public body, or 35 attended by, or open to, all members of a subcommittee if the public 36 body has determined that the meetings of that subcommittee shall 37 be open to the public in accordance with section 18 of 38 P.L., c. (C. ) (pending before the Legislature as this bill), 39 and held with the intent, on the part of the members of the body 40 present, to discuss or act as a unit upon the specific public business 41 of that body. Meeting does not mean or include any such gathering 42 (1) attended by less than **[**an effective majority of the members of **]** 43 a quorum of a public body, or (2) attended by or open to all the 44 members of three or more similar public bodies at a convention or 45 similar gathering. Meeting does not include a chance encounter or 46 any gathering at which members of a public body or of a 47 subcommittee do not discuss or act upon the public business of that 48 public body or subcommittee.

c. "Public business" means and includes all matters which relate in any way, directly or indirectly, to the performance of the public body's functions or the conduct of its business.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

48

d. "Adequate notice" means written advance notice of at least 48 hours, giving the time, date, location and **[**, to the extent known, the agenda of any regular, special or rescheduled meeting, which notice shall accurately state whether formal action may or may not be taken and which shall be (1) prominently posted on the public body's Internet site, if the public body has established an Internet site, and in at least one public place reserved for such or similar announcements, (2) mailed, telephoned, [telegrammed] faxed, mailed electronically, or hand delivered to at least two newspapers which newspapers shall be designated by the public body to receive such notices because they have the greatest likelihood of informing the public within the area of jurisdiction of the public body of such meetings, one of which shall be the official newspaper, where any such has been designated by the public body or if the public body has failed to so designate, where any has been designated by the governing body of the political subdivision whose geographic boundaries are coextensive with that of the public body and (3) filed with the clerk of the municipality when the public body's geographic boundaries are coextensive with that of a single municipality, with the clerk of the county when the public body's geographic boundaries are coextensive with that of a single county, and with the Secretary of State if the public body has Statewide jurisdiction. For any other public body the filing shall be with the clerk or chief administrative officer of such other public body and each municipal or county clerk of each municipality or county encompassed within the jurisdiction of such public body. Where annual notice or revisions thereof in compliance with section 13 of this act set forth the location of any meeting, no further notice shall be required for such meeting, except for notice pertaining to agendas and formal action on the public body's Internet site, if the body has established an Internet site, and posting in at least one public place reserved for such or similar announcements, transmittal to the newspapers described in paragraph (2) of this subsection and to any member of the public who shall have requested such notice. Notice shall not be considered "adequate notice" within the meaning of this subsection unless it includes the estimated starting time, as nearly so as can be established, for the beginning of the portion of any meeting from which the public is not excluded.

e. "Agenda" means the list of all items of business to be discussed or voted on at a public meeting. For purposes of providing adequate notice, agendas shall include each individual item to be discussed or acted upon, and a brief description thereof, and shall identify the names of the parties to and approximate dollar amounts of any contracts, including employment contracts and collective bargaining agreements, for which agreements the agenda

1 shall list the number, but not the names, of employees covered 2 thereby, to be discussed or acted upon. No public body shall act 3 upon a matter that is not listed on the agenda. In addition, a public 4 body, upon the affirmative vote of a majority of the members 5 present at a meeting, may add an item to the agenda for that meeting when necessary to deal with a matter of such urgency and 6 7 importance that a delay for the purpose of providing adequate 8 notice would be likely to result in substantial harm to the public 9 interest, and provided that the minutes contain a statement that 10 explains the reason for adding that item to the agenda, why the item 11 did not appear on the agenda for that meeting, and why delaying 12 consideration of the item would be likely to result in substantial 13 harm to the public interest, except that the Legislature may add an 14 item to its agenda at any time. Whenever a public body releases to 15 the public an agenda of a regular, special, or rescheduled meeting of 16 that public body, pursuant to this subsection, that includes a 17 reference to an attachment, appendix, or other document that is a 18 government record, the agenda shall include a statement that the 19 attachment, appendix, or other document shall be available to the 20 public for inspection, copying, or the purchase of copies. If any 21 member of the public, at least 24 hours prior to a meeting, requests 22 a copy of any attachment, appendix, or other document that is a 23 government record referenced in an agenda, the custodian thereof 24 shall send an electronic copy to the requestor. If such a request is 25 received within 24 hours prior to a meeting, an attachment, 26 appendix, or other document requested shall be made available to 27 the requestor at the meeting of the public body. 28

f. "Subcommittee" means any subordinate committee of a public body, except the Legislature, regardless of label, that is formally created by that body, comprised of two or more members, but less than a quorum, of the public body.

29

30

31

3233

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41 42

43

44

45

46

47

g. "Quasi-governmental agency" means any association, commission, agency, authority, organization, public-private entity, or any other entity, in which one or more public agencies exercise substantial control as evidenced by whether the public agency, as defined in section 1 of P.L.1995, c.23 (C.47:1A-1.1), maintains the ability to review, approve, or reject the quasi-governmental agency's proposals or plans, holds a beneficial interest in the quasigovernmental agency's assets, is the primary source of funding of, or is indebted to, or is a creditor of, or guarantor of the debts of, the quasi-governmental agency. The term shall not include any organization organized under paragraph (3) of subsection (c) of section 501 of the federal Internal Revenue Code (26 U.S.C. s.501) that was not created by, or with the approval of, a public agency primarily for the purpose of assisting that public agency or any labor organization or any contractor providing goods or services to a public agency. However, nothing contained herein shall affect the application of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.) to entities that
otherwise fall within the definition of "public body."

h. "Quorum" means a majority of the full membership of a public body or of a subcommittee.

(cf: P.L.1981, c.176, s.2)

- 3. Section 4 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-9) is amended to read as follows:
- 4. a. Except as provided by subsection b. of this section, or for any meeting limited only to consideration of items listed in subsection b. of section 7 [b.] of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12), no public body, and no subcommittee which the public body has determined shall have meetings open to the public in accordance with section 18 of P.L., c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill), shall hold a meeting unless adequate notice thereof has been provided to the public.
- b. Upon the affirmative vote of three-quarters of the members present a public body may hold a meeting notwithstanding the failure to provide adequate notice if:
- (1) such meeting is required in order to deal with matters of such urgency and importance that a delay for the purpose of providing adequate notice would be likely to result in substantial harm to the public interest; and
- (2) the meeting is limited to discussion of and acting with respect to such matters of urgency and importance; and
- (3) notice of such meeting is provided as soon as possible following the calling of such meeting by posting written notice of the same on the public body's Internet site, if the public body has established an Internet site and in the public place described in subsection d. of section 3 [d.] of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-8) above, and also by notifying the two newspapers described in section 3. d. by telephone, [telegram,] fax machine, electronic mail, or by delivering a written notice of same to such newspapers; and
- (4) **[**either (a)**]** the public body could not reasonably have foreseen the need for such meeting at a time when adequate notice could have been provided **[**; or (b) although the public body could reasonably have foreseen the need for such meeting at a time when adequate notice could have been provided, it nevertheless failed to do so **]**.
- 40 (cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.4)

- 42 4. Section 1 of P.L.2002, c.91 (C.10:4-9.1) is amended to read 43 as follows:
- 1. In addition to the notice requirements of the "Open Public Meetings Act," P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.), a public body [may] shall provide electronic notice of any meeting of the public

body through the Internet, if the public body maintains an Internet
site or pages on an Internet site.

As used in this section, "electronic notice" means advance notice available to the public via electronic transmission of at least 48 hours, giving the time, date, location and **[**, to the extent known, **]** the agenda of any regular, special or rescheduled meeting, which notice shall accurately state whether formal action may or may not be taken at such meeting.

As used in this section, "Internet" means the international computer network of both federal and non-federal interoperable packet switched data networks.

12 (cf: P.L.2002, c.91, s.1)

1314

15

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- 5. Section 7 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12) is amended to read as follows:
- 16 7. a. Except as provided by subsection b. of this section all 17 meetings of public bodies shall be open to the public at all times. 18 Except for communications that are purely administrative or 19 procedural in nature, no member of a public body, other than the 20 Legislature, during any meeting of that public body to which the 21 public is admitted, shall communicate privately, by means of 22 communication equipment, including electronic mail, instant 23 messaging or similar technologies, including directly or indirectly 24 through staff or legal counsel, with any other member of the public 25 body about any matter on the agenda for that meeting, and no 26 member shall communicate privately with any other person, other 27 than staff, legal counsel, or independent consultants or advisers, 28 about any matter on the agenda for that meeting by means of 29 communication equipment, including electronic mail, instant 30 messaging or similar technologies. Nothing in this act shall be 31 construed to limit the discretion of a public body to permit, prohibit, 32 or regulate the active participation of the public at any meeting, 33 except that a [municipal governing] public body [and a board of education], other than the Legislature, shall be required to set aside 34 35 a portion of every meeting of the [municipal governing] public 36 body [or board of education, the length of the portion to be 37 determined by the municipal governing body or board of 38 education, for public comment at the meeting in question, with 39 such comments being limited to items on the agenda and on any 40 governmental [or school district] issue that a member of the public 41 feels may be of concern to <u>and within the authority of</u> the **[**residents 42 of the municipality or school district public body. A public body, 43 other than the Legislature, shall permit all proceedings of any 44 public meeting to be recorded, photographed, audiotaped, 45 videotaped, broadcast or recorded for broadcast by any member of 46 the public or news organization, subject only to such reasonable

rules as the public body may adopt prior to the meeting to minimize
undue disruption to its meetings.

A public body shall prepare a written policy that is intended to maximize public participation and that addresses the amount of time it will devote to receiving public comments at meetings and shall include that written policy on each meeting agenda prepared by the public body and on the public body's Internet site, if the public body has established an Internet site, and in the public place described in subsection d. of section 3 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-8). The Director of the Division of Local Government Services in the Department of Community Affairs shall prepare guidelines for public bodies that create minimum standards ensuring public participation.

Whenever the provisions of any other law address the receipt of public comments by a public body, the provisions of that law and the provisions of this section shall be complied with to the maximum extent possible and practical; however, the provisions of the Municipal Land Use Law, P.L.1975, c.291 (C.40:55D-1 et seq.), regarding the receipt of public comments shall be followed notwithstanding the provisions of this section.

- b. A public body may exclude the public only from that portion of a meeting at which the public body discusses any:
- (1) matter which, by express provision of federal law, State statute, or rule of court shall be rendered confidential or excluded from the provisions of subsection a. of this section;
- (2) matter in which the release of information would impair a right to receive funds from the Government of the United States;
- (3) material the disclosure of which constitutes an unwarranted invasion of individual privacy such as any records, data, reports, recommendations, or other personal material of any educational, training, social service, medical, health, custodial, child protection, rehabilitation, legal defense, welfare, housing, relocation, insurance, and similar program or institution operated by a public body pertaining to any specific individual admitted to or served by an institution or program, including but not limited to, information relative to the individual's personal and family circumstances, and any material pertaining to admission, discharge, treatment, progress, or condition of any individual, unless the individual concerned (or, in the case of a minor or an incapacitated individual, the individual's guardian) shall request in writing that the material be disclosed publicly;
- (4) collective bargaining agreement, or the terms and conditions which are proposed for inclusion in any collective bargaining agreement, including the negotiation of the terms and conditions thereof with employees or representatives of employees of the public body;
- (5) matter involving the purchase, lease, or acquisition of real property with public funds, the setting of banking rates, or

investment of public funds, if [it] <u>public discussion</u> could adversely affect the public interest if discussion of the matters were disclosed;

- (6) tactics and techniques utilized in protecting the safety and property of the public, provided that their disclosure could impair that protection, or investigations of violations or **[**possible**]** <u>probable</u> violations of the law;
- (7) [pending or anticipated litigation or contract negotiation] consultation with legal counsel concerning the legal rights and duties of the public body with regard to current litigation or litigation likely to be filed in connection with any executed contract which the public body is, or is likely to become, a party, or concerning current or anticipated contract negotiations, other than in subsection b. (4) herein in which the public body is, or may become, a party, or matters falling within the attorney-client privilege, to the extent that confidentiality is required in order for the attorney to exercise his ethical duties as a lawyer;
- (8) matter involving the employment, appointment, termination of employment, [terms and conditions of employment,] evaluation of the performance of, promotion, or disciplining of any specific [prospective public officer or employee or current] public officer or employee, prospective or current, employed or appointed by the public body [, unless all the individual employees or appointees whose rights could be adversely affected request in writing that the matter or matters be discussed at a public meeting 1. Public bodies shall give written notice of at least two business days to any officer or employee, and any adversely affected individual or individuals, in advance of any proposed meeting at which his or her employment, appointment, termination, evaluation of the performance of, promotion or discipline may be discussed. The matter or matters pertaining to him or her shall be discussed in closed session unless the officer or employee and any adversely affected individual or individuals, but not a third party representative, requests in writing that the matter or matters be discussed in open session. This paragraph shall not apply to a public body's discussions or actions relating to tenure matters if any statute or collective bargaining agreement shall provide otherwise.
- (9) deliberations of a public body occurring after a public hearing that may result in the imposition of a specific civil penalty upon the responding party or the suspension or loss of a license or permit belonging to the responding party as a result of an act or omission for which the responding party bears responsibility.
- c. The grounds for exclusion of the public set forth in subsection b. of this section shall be construed strictly to minimize instances in which meetings or portions of meetings are closed to the public. The public may not be excluded from a public body's discussion of actual contracts or executed contracts, except that a public body may go into closed session for consultations with legal

1 counsel, pursuant to paragraph (7) of subsection b. of this section, 2 when there is current litigation, or litigation is likely to be filed, 3 concerning an actual or executed contract.

4 (cf: P.L.2013, c.103, s.57)

5

- 6. Section 8 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-13) is amended to read as follows:
- 8. No public body shall exclude the public from any meeting to discuss any matter described in subsection <u>b. of section</u> 7 **[**b.**]** of <u>P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12)</u> until the public body shall first adopt a resolution, at a meeting to which the public shall be admitted:
- a. Stating the **[**general nature of the **]** reasonably specific subject to be discussed and the reasonably specific basis for excluding the public; and
  - b. Stating as precisely as possible, the time when and the circumstances under which the discussion conducted in closed session of the public body can be disclosed to the public.

18 (cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.8)

19

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

3132

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

15

16

- 20 7. Section 9 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-14) is amended to read 21 as follows:
  - 9. a. The Legislature shall keep comprehensive minutes of all of its meetings showing the time and place, the members present, the subjects considered, the actions taken, the vote of each member, and any other information required to be shown in the minutes by law, which shall be promptly available to the public to the extent that making such matters public shall not be inconsistent with section 7 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12).
  - b. Each public body, other than the Legislature, shall [keep reasonably comprehensible] keep comprehensive minutes of all its meetings, including any portion of a meeting from which the public was excluded pursuant to section 7 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12), showing, at a minimum, the time and place, the members present, the subjects considered, the actions taken, including all motions made, the identities of the moving and seconding members, the vote of each member and each member's stated reasons, if any, for his or her action or vote, the identity of each member of the public who spoke and a summary of what was said, and any other information required to be shown in the minutes by law [, which].
- 40 Minutes shall be made available to the public as soon as possible but not later than 15 business days after the next meeting of the 41 42 public body occurring after the meeting for which the minutes were 43 prepared, to the extent that making such matters public shall not be 44 inconsistent with section 7 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12). In the 45 case of a municipality having a population of 5,000 or fewer 46 inhabitants according to the most recent federal decennial census, a 47 board of education having a total district enrollment of 500 or fewer

pupils, or a public authority having less than \$10 million in assets,
the minutes of the meeting shall be made available not later than 20
business days after the next subsequent meeting.

A public body may vote at that next subsequent meeting in favor of a reasonable delay in making the minutes available due to an emergency that would preclude the public body from abiding by the 15- or 20-day requirement, respectively. Prior to taking such vote, the public body shall announce and provide a detailed explanation of the reason for the delay. The public body shall include that explanation in the minutes of the meeting at which the vote took place.

As used in this subsection, "emergency" means any sudden, unexpected, or unforeseeable event or condition, natural or manmade, which interferes with the conduct of normal business operations of a public body for three or more calendar days. Without limiting the generality of the foregoing, an emergency may arise when a condition such as any one or more of the following arises: forces of the natural elements, fire, explosions, epidemics, power failures, labor disputes, transportation failures, war, riots, civil disturbances, and other acts of lawlessness or violence.

c. Any member of a public body, other than the Legislature, who becomes aware of a meeting held in violation of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.), including electronic communications among members of a public body or of a subcommittee which the public body has determined shall hold meetings open to the public in accordance with section 18 of P.L., c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill), constituting a quorum thereof, that do not address a purely administrative matter, shall inform the presiding member who shall ensure that minutes of such meetings shall be made, and such electronic communications, if any, shall be filed with the clerk of the public body for a period of time to be determined by the State Records Committee to permit their use in litigation, to enforce the provisions of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.), or for public access.

d. Each public body that possesses sound recording devices that are available and functioning shall cause to be recorded by those sound recording devices only the public portions of all meetings of that public body, including any emergency meeting held pursuant to section 4 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-9), and shall maintain possession of the recordings for a period of time to be determined by the State Records Committee to permit their use in litigation, to enforce the provisions of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.), or for public access. Sound recordings, or any video recordings, shall reflect the public portions of meetings in their entirety, including the public comment portions of meetings. The unedited recordings shall be promptly made available to the public, but not later than the fifth business day following the meeting, to the extent that making such matters public shall not be inconsistent with section 7 of this

act. Public bodies shall only present the recordings as official and authentic representations of the public meetings if presented in their unedited form. Public bodies, if presenting edited versions of the recording, shall conspicuously label such as an edited version and shall include a notification that the official unedited recording is available on request from the public body.

e. A subcommittee of a public body, other than the Legislature, shall prepare reports of its meetings, including any gathering that would otherwise be a meeting if it were open to the public, which shall be filed with the public body pursuant to a schedule prepared by the public body, except that every subcommittee shall be required to file at least one report with the public body each quarter. A report shall include a statement of the number of meetings of the subcommittee held since its last report, the names of the members of the subcommittee, and a concise statement of the matters discussed. A report of a subcommittee shall be available for public access in the same manner, and subject to the same limitations on access, as minutes of a meeting of a public body. A subcommittee that has given an oral report at a meeting of the public body of which it is a subcommittee shall be excused from providing the public body with a written report for that quarter.

(cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.9)

8. Section 10 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-15) is amended to read as follows:

10. a. Any action taken by a public body at a meeting which does not conform with the provisions of this act shall be voidable in a proceeding in lieu of prerogative writ in the Superior Court, which proceeding may be brought by any person within 45 calendar days after the [action sought to be voided has been made public] date of the public meeting at which the minutes memorializing the action sought to be voided are approved and put online pursuant to section 16 of P.L., c. (C. ) (pending before the Legislature as this bill); provided, however, that a public body may take corrective or remedial action by acting de novo at a public meeting held in conformity with this act and other applicable law regarding any action which may otherwise be voidable pursuant to this section; and provided further that any action for which advance published notice of at least 48 hours is provided as required by law shall not be voidable solely for failure to conform with any notice required in this act.

b. Any party, including any member of the public, may institute a proceeding in lieu of prerogative writ in the Superior Court to challenge any action taken by a public body on the grounds that such action is void for the reasons stated in subsection a. of this section, and if the court shall find that the action was taken at a meeting which does not conform to the provisions of this act, the court shall declare such action void. Any party, other than a public

- 1 body, that prevails in an action brought pursuant to this section
- 2 shall be awarded the amount of reasonable attorney's fees incurred
- 3 in bringing the action. The cost of any attorney's fee awarded by
- 4 the court shall be paid by the public body.
- 5 (cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.10)

6

9

11

- 7 9. Section 11 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-16) is amended to 8 read as follows:
- 11. Any person, including a member of the public, may apply to 10 the Superior Court for injunctive orders or other remedies to insure compliance with the provisions of this act, and the court shall issue 12 such orders and provide such remedies as shall be necessary to 13 insure compliance with the provisions of this act. Any party, other 14 than a public body, that prevails in an action brought pursuant to 15 this section, shall be awarded the amount of reasonable attorney's fees incurred in bringing the action. The cost of any attorney's fee awarded by the court shall be paid by the public body.
- 17 18 (cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.11)

19 20

21

- 10. Section 12 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-17) is amended to read as follows:
- 22 12. Any person who knowingly violates any of the foregoing 23 sections of this act shall be fined [\$100.00] \$250.00 for the first 24 offense and no less than [\$100.00 nor more than] \$500.00 for any subsequent offense [, recoverable by the State by] . A fine shall be 25 26 paid by the individual found to have committed the violation out of 27 that individual's personal funds. Under no circumstances shall 28 public funds, or contributions as defined in subsection b. of section 29 3 of P.L.1973, c.83 (C.19:44A-3) of "The New Jersey Campaign 30 Contributions and Expenditures Reporting Act," be used to pay a 31 fine or to reimburse a person who has paid, or will pay, a fine for 32 the cost of that fine. The Attorney General or county prosecutor, or 33 any member of the public, shall have standing to bring an action in 34 Superior Court to prove that a violation of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-
- 35 6 et seq.) has occurred.
- 36 An action may be brought in a summary proceeding under ["the 37 penalty enforcement law" (N.J.S.2A:58-1 et seq.) the "Penalty 38 Enforcement Law of 1999," P.L.1999, c.274 (C.2A:58-10 et seq.). 39 The Superior Court shall have jurisdiction to enforce said penalty 40 upon complaint of the Attorney General or the county prosecutor <u>.or</u> 41 any member of the public. Whenever a member of a public body, 42 or any member of the staff of the public body, believes that a 43 meeting of such body is being held in violation of the provisions of 44 this act, he shall immediately state this at the meeting together with 45 specific reasons for his belief which shall be recorded in the 46 minutes of that meeting, and if the meeting is one from which the 47 public is excluded, the member's or staff member's statement and

1 reasons shall also be announced at and recorded in the minutes of 2 the next meeting of the public body at which the public is not 3 excluded. Whenever such a member's or staff member's objections 4 to the holding of such meeting are overruled by the majority of 5 those present, such a member or staff member may continue to 6 participate at such meeting without penalty provided he has complied with the duties imposed upon him by this section. 7 8 (cf: P.L.1994, c.58, s.41)

9 10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

45

46

47

11. Section 13 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-18) is amended to read as follows:

13. At least once each year, within 7 days following the annual organization or reorganization meeting of a public body, or if there be no such organization or reorganization meeting in the year, then by not later than January 10 of such year, every public body shall post and maintain posted throughout the year on the public body's Internet site, if the public body has established an Internet site, and in the place reserved for such or similar announcements described in subsection 3. d. (1), mail to the newspapers described in subsection 3. d. (2), submit to the persons described in subsection 3. d. (3), for the purpose of public inspection a schedule of the regular meetings of the public body to be held during the succeeding year. Such schedule shall contain the location of each meeting to the extent it is known, and the time and date of each meeting. In the event that such schedule is thereafter revised, the public body, within 7 days following such revision, shall post, mail and submit such revision in the manner described above.

28 ( 29

(cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.13)

12. Section 14 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-19) is amended to read as follows:

14. Any person may request that a public body mail or electronically mail to him, at his option, notice of agendas of all meetings, copies of any regular meeting schedule or revision described in section 13 of this act and any advance written notice described in subsection 3. d. of this act of any regular, special or rescheduled meeting of such body, and upon prepayment by such person of a reasonable sum, if any has been fixed by resolution of the public body to cover the costs of providing such notice, the public body shall mail to such person written advance notice of all of its meetings within the time prescribed by subsection 3. d. herein, subject only to the exceptions set forth in subsection 4. b. herein. Such resolution may provide that notice requested by the news media shall be mailed to such news media free of charge. If a person requests advance written notice by electronic mail, no payment shall be required. All requests for notices made under this section shall terminate at midnight on December 31 of each year,

## S379 WEINBERG

15

but shall be subject to renewal upon a new request to the public body.

(cf: P.L.1975, c.231, s.14)

3 4 5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

1617

18

19

20

2122

23

24

13. (New section) In the case of State agencies, other than the Legislature, the Secretary of State, through the Department of State, shall create and maintain an Internet site for the posting of information, including the time, date, location, and purpose, of public hearings and meetings of State agencies. Each State agency shall promptly notify the Secretary of State and submit the necessary information concerning that agency's public hearings and meetings. The secretary shall maintain on that site an electronic public bulletin board that includes a monthly calendar consisting of the meeting notices and agendas of all State agencies, boards and commissions. The public bulletin board shall also include links to other information of interest to the public, including, but not limited to, Executive Branch press releases, State budget information, bidding opportunities, election law enforcement information, and financial and ethics disclosure information. The Internet site created pursuant to this section shall also post information that is provided to the Secretary of State by a public body pursuant to section 16 of P.L., c. (C. ) (pending before the Legislature as this bill). All information posted pursuant to this section shall remain posted for a period of time determined by the State Records Committee.

252627

28

29

30

31

32

33

14. (New section) At least quarterly, a public body, other than the Legislature, shall conduct a review of the minutes of any previous meeting when any part has been withheld from public access. The review shall determine whether any part of any minutes that have been withheld from public access can now be made accessible to the public. If the public body determines that any part of previously withheld minutes can now be disclosed to the public, it shall make that part thereof accessible to the public.

343536

37

38

39

40 41 15. (New section) In addition to any other penalties imposed by law, an appointed member of a public body may be removed from the public body by the appointing authority because of two or more violations of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.) that result in a significant denial of the public's right of access as provided by that act upon a determination by a court of competent jurisdiction that a denial of access was significant.

42 43 44

45

46

47

48

16. (New section) a. Every public body, other than the Legislature, that maintains or publishes an Internet site, or maintains or publishes web pages on an Internet site operated by a government or non-public entity, shall have posted on that site: the public body's annual schedule of regular meetings and its agendas of those meetings

and revisions thereto; notice of any meeting held without adequate notice pursuant to one of the exceptions to the adequate notice requirement listed in subsection b. of section 4 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-9); the minutes, prepared pursuant to section 9 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-14), of each meeting of the public body, including a statement that the minutes of the closed portion of any meeting shall be available upon request if those minutes have been deemed to be a government record, as defined in section 1 of P.L.1995, c.23 (C.47:1A-1.1), which shall remain posted on the site for a period of at least five years from the date of posting; resolutions and ordinances, to the extent they are not already set forth in the minutes; any resolution adopted by the public body for the purpose of complying with the provisions of section 8 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-13), which shall remain posted on the site for a period of at least five years from the date of posting; and, in the case of municipalities and counties, their ordinances.

- b. A public body that does not maintain or publish an Internet site and does not maintain or publish web pages on an Internet site operated by a government or non-public entity shall promptly provide the information specified in subsection a. of this section to the Secretary of State for posting on the Internet site created pursuant to section 13 of P.L. , c. (C. ) (pending before the Legislature as this bill). For the purposes of P.L.1975, c. 231 (C.10:4-6 et seq.), the Internet site to which the information is submitted shall be deemed established by each submitting public body.
- c. A public body that is subject to subsection a. of this section may comply therewith by providing the information specified in subsection a. of this section to the Secretary of State and providing a link thereto on its own website.
- d. Public bodies that maintain an Internet site or pages on that site pursuant to this section shall provide any requestor with free paper copies of any information that is required to be posted on the Internet site but is not so posted.
- e. All information posted pursuant to this section shall remain posted for a period of time determined by the State Records Committee.

17. (New section) When a public body provides information on the Internet, it shall make a reasonable effort to make the existence and location of its site or pages known to members of the public within its jurisdiction by, at a minimum, including such information in its required written public notices, agendas, and minutes and by announcing it at its public meetings.

18. (New section) A public body shall determine for each subcommittee whether meetings of that subcommittee shall be open to the public. For a meeting of a subcommittee that will be open to the public, the public body shall provide adequate notice of that

## S379 WEINBERG

meeting; however, other requirements applicable to meetings of public bodies shall not apply to meetings of a subcommittee. A subcommittee that holds meetings open to the public may exclude the public only from that portion of a meeting at which the subcommittee discusses matters set forth in subsection b. of section 7 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-12), and if pursuant to the procedures set forth in section 8 of P.L.1975, c.231 (C.10:4-13).

19. This act shall take effect on the 120th day after the date of enactment.

#### **STATEMENT**

This bill revises the "Senator Byron M. Baer Open Public Meetings Act," N.J.S.A.10:4-6 et seq., to provide greater public access to meetings of public bodies and information about those meetings. The bill clarifies and expands the public's right to receive notice of meetings of public bodies, to be present at such meetings and, under certain circumstances, to be heard at meetings, as well as to have access to minutes of meetings. It extends the scope of the act to apply certain of its provisions to subcommittees and to include certain quasi-governmental entities. The bill also addresses issues relating to communications among members of a public body, the recording of meetings, the posting of meeting-related information on the Internet, the use of closed sessions, and penalties for violations.